

To Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
June 14, 2022

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7R01107 –
"PULMONOLOGY (ADULT, CHILDREN'S)"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR
POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY)
IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

NEI "KAZAKH-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"

external expert evaluation period: May 30-31 - June 1, 2022

Almaty, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1.	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"	5
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	7
2.3.	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	7
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	10
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"	11
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"	24
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	25
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of the external evaluation and educational programme of the residency in the specialty of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"	26
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	27

List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Interpretation
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team -based learning
University	Higher education institution
EEC	External expert commission
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
CEP	Educational Programmes Committee
KRMU	Kazakh-Russian Medical University
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC	Non-profit joint-stock company
IAAR	Independent agency for accreditation and rating
RI	Research Institute
RW	Research work
NLA	Normative legal acts
NEI	Non-State educational institution
EP	Educational programme
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
PHC	Primary Medical health care
TS	Teaching staff
WC	Work Curriculum
IWS	Independent work of the student (resident)
IWRT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
SC	Scientific Council

1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 19 dated May 20, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of the residence in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" in the period May 30-June 1, 2022, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Academic degree, academic title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of clinical specialties department of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, leading researcher of JSC "Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology"
2	Foreign Expert	Zakirova Guzel Zakirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Ophthalmology of Kazan State Medical University, Ophthalmologist of the Children's Republican Clinical Hospital of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Tatarstan
3	Academic Expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna	doctor of Medical Sciences head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 - "Medical University of Astana" NJSC;
4	Academic Expert	Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldinovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Vice-Rector for Educational and Scientific Activities Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH", Accredited independent expert on the assessment of the quality of medical services, Deputy Chairperson of the Board of the RPO "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations"
5	Academic Expert	Sarsenbayeva Gulzhan Iskendirovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Doctor of the Department of Cardiac Surgery and Interventional Cardiology of the Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery JSC
6	Academic Expert	Bacheva Irina Viktorovna	PhD in Medicine, associate Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases, Head of the Residency Educational Programme in Nephrology, including Pediatric, NJSC Medical University of Karaganda
7	Academic Expert	Laryushina Elena Mikhailovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor, head of the Department of Internal Diseases NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"
8	Academic Expert	Sultanova Gulnar Dosnovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Dean of the Faculties of Dentistry, Pharmacy, Public Health Care and Nursing NJSC "Western Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
9	Employers' representative	Nurgaliyev Nurlan Yermekbayevich	Director general of GammaLab Diagnostic Laboratory LLP
10	Resident Representative	Maykenova Arailim Muratkyzy	Resident of the first year of study in the specialty "Gastroenterology (adult, children's)" of NJSC

			"Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" ..
--	--	--	---

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" "

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-State educational institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300
Management body	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created in	1992
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2021
Duration of training	2
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	-
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	2
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	10/0, 90%

The University currently represents the organization of medical education with a private form of ownership, having the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel (license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010). Over the years, the university has shaped its brand, traditions and values, continuing to follow the course to universities of the international level, indicated

by the country's leadership. The principles of the Bologna process, the credit system of training are implemented in all specialties of the bachelor's degree.

Since 2011, the University publishes a quarterly magazine "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine".

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", the University was accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activity, certificate number Series MK No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018.

The university's budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (a state order for the training of specialists of higher, postgraduate and additional education), the provision of paid educational services.

The financing of the university is stable and contributes to improving the material and technical base and increasing the contingent.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, for his achievements in the development of mobile medical complexes, Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev was awarded the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute of Quality Standard "International Quality Certificate" (SIQS) on July 1, 2015.

In order to develop cooperation, 30 agreements, agreements and memoranda with Kazakhstan and foreign higher educational institutions have been concluded.

The NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" implements 35 educational programmes of the residency. In 2021, there was the first set of residents in the specialty EP 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"

Requirements for the level of training of graduates of the residency in the specialty – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" are formulated in the educational programme in accordance with: the State Mandatory Standard of the Residency in Medical Specialties and the standard professional curriculum for medical specialties of the residency, the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated July 31, 2015, as amended by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-12/2020; the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" (Art. 36 "Postgraduate education"); the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI "On public health and the health care system"; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, nomenclature and qualification characteristics of health care workers"; Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2018 No.563 "On approval of the Rules for the organization of the educational process on credit technology of training"; Rules for the admission of medical personnel to training in the residency, approved by Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020; Rules for admission to the residency of the NEI "KRMU" for 2020-2021 academic year; "Academic policy of the NEI" KRMU"; "Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students"; academic calendar of educational programmes of the residency; individual work plans of the student of the residency.

Studying in the residency in the specialty EP 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" is carried out on a full-time basis, the term of study is 2 years. According to the SCES, the educational programme of training of residents is designed for 140 loans, including - the profile disciplines: a mandatory component – 132 loans, a component of choice – 4 loans, interim certification – 2 loans, final certification – 2 loans.

2.2. Information on previous accreditation

To date, the accreditation of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" has not been carried out.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The self-assessment report on the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 128 pages of the main text, 46 copies and electronic versions of documents [located at https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14HwOLGx9TRQtLU52VaCBZtcVaOjl5FO](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/14HwOLGx9TRQtLU52VaCBZtcVaOjl5FO).

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 8 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by Rector N.T. Dzhainakbayev, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

Standard 9 "Continuous renewal" will be included in the assessment during post-accreditation monitoring in case of a positive decision on the accreditation of the educational programme.

The report contains a list of 9 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Bekmagambetov Zh.M., Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Accreditation

The self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the Rector of the University No. 26-02-20-n/k dated February 25, 2022 "On the creation of a working group for conducting a specialized self-assessment and writing a report" (composition of the steering committee of the internal commission for self-assessment of educational programmes in the specialties of residency).

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert Urazova S.N., the review noted the strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback from the university representative and the report on self-assessment was amended accordingly.

All the standards provide real practice of the university for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external

evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on May 20, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector of KazRossmeduniversity (hereinafter – KRMU/University) Dzhainakbayev N.T. Dates of the visit to the organization: 30 May-1 June 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 14 people in total;
- interviews with residents – 14 people, including foreign ones (resident – Mishra Santosh Kumar from India);
- studying the website <https://krmu.edu.kz/>;
- interviewing 8 employees, 8 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents - 14 and 12, respectively;
- observation of training of residents: observation of training of residents: attendance at a practical lesson ("Eosinophilic granulomatosis of Cherja-stross", teacher: Zordinova K.A., group: AII 20-01, CCH No. 1;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: visited the practice/clinical engagement database of the State Clinical Hospital No. 1, where training is conducted under the residency programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" with the participation of 2 full-time teachers and 2 part-time employees;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 36 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members

№	Full name	Job Title
Residency Teachers		
1	Zordinova Karamyat Akhmetovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Internal Medicine
2	Gulnara Serikovna Esnazarova	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Internal Medicine
3	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice
4	Karabaeva Aigul Zhumartovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department of General Medical Practice
Student residencies		
11	Askarbekova Aidana Yerikovna	resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"
12	Mishra Santosh Kumar	resident of the 1st year of study in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"
Healthcare Practitioners		

1	Baizhigitova Nazipa Begalievna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital No.1
2	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of the State Clinical Hospital on the Right of Economic Management "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"
3	Zhumataeva Zarina Akhmetovna	Director of MC "Rakhat"
4	Isabekov Nurzhan Amangeldiyevich	Deputy Director of Surgery, CCCH
5	Kunaeva Gulbanu Janabaevna	Deputy Director for Strategic Development of the CCCH
6	Bukumbayeva Damira Dzhurumbayevna	IE "Bukumbayeva"

During the visit to the University, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the organization of education in relation to the accredited educational programme, including: a high level of degree, categorization and long pedagogical experience of the teaching staff, the availability of modern clinical bases for achieving the goals of education, contributing to adequate training of residents, a well-stocked library with wide access to various information resources, a strong structure and staff of the department of remote technologies, the availability of a mobile medical complex for diagnostic and therapeutic activities for adults and children in emergency situations.

At the University there are units that are directly related to the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)", which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the educational and clinical center, the library, the department of distance technologies. This conclusion is made because the residents of this specialty have the opportunity to hone their practical skills in the training and clinical center; the developed structure of remote technologies, a rich resource of information access to literature allows students to improve their professional level, and also helps in research work, advanced training. Teachers can also use these resources in both education and research.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Kurmanova A.M. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the university, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

4. Results of the survey

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 30.05.2022 <https://webanketa.com/>.

Resident survey results:

Total number of respondents –12. The resident survey includes 22 questions.

When studying the results of the survey, the overwhelming majority - 75% of respondents answered that they would recommend this university as an educational institution, partially agreed with this statement 25%.

83.3% of respondents believe that programme managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to training, 8.33% partially support this statement and 8.33% found it difficult to answer.

The assessment of satisfaction with the conditions for training and the equipment of the training rooms and classrooms of the KRMU showed that 83.3% are completely satisfied with the conditions provided, 8.3% – partially and doubt the answer 8.3%.

According to 100% of respondents, office equipment is available on the basis of practice. Teachers fully, in 100% of cases provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes.

100% of the surveyed residents are completely satisfied with the library fund and resources. All 100% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources.

The organization of clinical training, according to 75% of respondents, fully satisfies them, but 25% - partially. The majority of students (91.67 per cent) are fully satisfied with the teaching methods and 8.33 per cent are partially satisfied.

All 100% noted that there is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.). On the question "Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills", the majority of 91.67% fully agree, and 8.33% - partially.

According to 91.67% of residents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in classes, and according to 8.33% - sometimes.

According to 100% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes.

Fully satisfied that study in higher education 83,33%, and 16,67% of respondents - partially. According to 91.67% of respondents, the UNIVERSITY allows to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, but cannot give an answer - 8.33%. 100% are fully satisfied with the organization of teaching in the NGO KRMU.

According to 75% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 16.67% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 8.33% doubt the answer.

The work of the EEC was assessed as positive – 91.67% of residents, satisfactory – 8.33%.

Results of the survey of teachers of resident programmes:

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions.

In total, 14 teachers were surveyed, including those with up to 5 years of experience – 7.14%, up to 10 years – 28.57%, more than 10 years – 64.29%.

All respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process. Also all 100% answered that ethics and subordination are observed in higher education institution. Completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 92.86% of respondents, partially - 7.14%. 100% fully agree that there is an opportunity for career development in the organization and the development of the competence of teachers.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research – 100% completely agree.

92,86% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, doubt with the answer – 7,14%. The majority of those surveyed have undergone refresher training over the past 5 years. 100% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals. Unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, they applied for payment of travel, business trips, registration fee – 7.14%, for payment of registration fee – 7.14%, and 35.71% did not apply with this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university.

100% of respondents fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 42.86% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 7.14% used them, 28.57% do not know and 21.43% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers -92.86%, sometimes -7.14% of the respondents.

Students are taught using a variety of teaching methods, but more often work is done by analyzing situational tasks (88.06%), working in small groups (92.86%), lectures (50%), interactive learning (64.29%), performing abstracts (50%), performing projects, coursework (50%), practical classes in clinical skills at the training and clinical center (50%), oral analysis of the topic of classes (78.57%) oral surveys and analysis of the topic (64.29%), working in small groups (50%) also problem-oriented learning (57.14%), solving tests (71.43%), solving cases (42.86%), less often written completion of tasks (28.57%).

Completely according to 92.86% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 7.14% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey in general demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)"'

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

Evidence of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement and deliverables

The analysis of the self-assessment report and the results of the interview showed that the university communicates information about the University Mission and educational programmes through the official website www.medkrmu.kz. Residents claim that at meetings with the management of the university, as well as at the curatorial hours, they study the Mission of the programme, the goals and the tasks of training. The final learning outcomes common to all residency programmes are posted on the official website of the university <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura/>.

The mission of the educational programme is formulated taking into account the demands of practical health care, is presented in the educational programme. The educational programme presents the final results, which are also available in syllabuses and are available to teachers and students through the university portal. Scorecards record the extent to which resident learning outcomes have been achieved.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Training of residents in EP 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" is carried out on the basis of multidisciplinary clinics of the city with highly qualified personnel. Thus, experts visited the clinical base - SH No.1, where the ability of residents to practice practical skills near the patient's bed was demonstrated, and further work on the MMC was shown. Under the guidance of supervisors, they master the professional ethical and communication skills necessary for the work of a doctor.

The autonomy of the university with the adoption of a number of regulatory documents in the field of academic freedom of the university is manifested in the development of the educational programme, in the possibility of making managerial decisions in terms of the formation of personnel, rules for admission to programmes, while observing external requirements. For example, persons who have scored at least 75 points out of 100 on a paid basis and 75 or higher on a state educational grant are enrolled in the Pediatrics residency.

1.3 Learning outcomes

The final results of the training are clearly formulated and correspond to the direction of the specialist's training. The programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" was developed

within the framework of the SRS of the Residency and the Qualification Characteristics of the Doctor, it takes into account the main final results of the training of the resident pulmonologist, including knowledge, skills, the need for analysis, communication skills and continuous training. During clinical training, residents master the final results of training, providing training in an interdisciplinary team, develop the ability to effectively interact with colleagues. The head of the Department of Internal Diseases is also a physician of the State Clinical Hospital No. 1, which improves residents' access to hospital resources and provides them with ample opportunities to master practical professional skills, allows them to fill in documentation through the login of mentors.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

All interested parties (university staff, residency graduates, health and education management bodies, healthcare organizations, employers, professional medical associations, the public) participate in the formation of the mission and the final results of training in the NJSC KRMU, taking into account their proposals. The data were confirmed by employees, faculty members, residents, employers during the interview.

The mission and final results of the training of 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" are formulated on the basis of the Standard for the organization in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Representatives of the main stakeholders are involved in the formulation of the mission of the EP by discussing the draft mission of the EP at the level of: students, at an enlarged meeting of the Department of Faculty Therapy, the Academic Committee, which includes representatives of employers/representatives of practical health care, students and representatives of various clinical specialties.

Graduates in interviews, employers, as well as residents in the survey expressed that they would recommend this university for training, which speaks in favor of the high prestige of the university and its ambitious goals and mission.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17.

Standard 1: Implemented

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Evidence of compliance:

2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

Educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" was developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Standard Educational Standard, the standard curriculum.

The standard curriculum provides for 2-year training in the residency, with the total minimum amount of hours 4200 (140 credits) and obtaining a qualification - a Pulmonologist, which also meets the requirements of the State Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated 21.02.2020. Mandatory disciplines/modules reflected in the EP, as well as the university component are optionally included in the educational programme in the specialty in 4 modules.

Also, as a mandatory requirement, the programme includes 2 loans of the "Interim Certification" and 2 loans of the "Final Certification". In total, the educational programme in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" consists of 140 credits.

The list of the most common diseases and conditions to be diagnosed and treated by a pulmonologist, given in the Model Curriculum for the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" is fully covered by the list of nosologies and conditions that must be mastered by the resident according to the programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)".

The experts of the EEC confirm that the documents of the organization have work programmes, the EMCD, where the goal is defined, the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work is taken into account. Attending the practical lesson on the topic "Eosinophilic granulomatosis of Chervak-Strauss", the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan. The practical lesson was held not in a typical format, but in the form of a meeting

of the Journal Club for resident doctors of 3 related specialties. While attending a practical lesson on the topic and talking to residents, experts saw that the organization contributes to the development of practical competencies of residents. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EP EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

This indicates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

2.2 Scientific method

In KRMU, the practice of conducting scientific research is generally accepted, that is, residents at the department are offered topics conducted at the supervising department. Thus, according to the accredited specialty, 1 resident has a publication on the experience of "COVID" patients, the article is a joint work with the staff of the department. Experts studied the portfolio of residents, where there are protocols for critical analysis of articles, when visiting the library, databases to which access is available are demonstrated, residents use national clinical protocols in daily practice, which is confirmed when visiting the clinical base. In this specialty, 2 residents of the 1st year of study are trained, who noted that they have priority topics related to Covid-19, since residents work in the pulmonology department. In addition, the department practices holding meetings of the magazine club, where the main current directions in all related specialties of the residency are reported. In particular, on the day of the visit to the clinical base, experts attended a meeting for residents of 3 related specialties: pulmonology, allergology and rheumatology. At this meeting, the "Churg-Strauss Syndrome" was reported, the residents showed their skills in assessing critical literature.

However, it should be noted that residents do not have a clearly defined research plan, do not have a specific research topic. On a question - whether they are familiar with methods of carrying out scientific analysis, biostatistics, evidentiary medicine, received the answer that passed these subjects earlier during the bachelor's period.

Thus, when conducting interviews with residents and studying the documentation, experts did not find confirmation of the use of scientific analysis methods when performing tasks, there are no specific indicators confirming the performance of research work by residents.

2.3 Content of the residency programme

In accordance with the 2017 State Standard, the 2020 State Standard developed modular educational programmes in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)".

The educational programme for training residents in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines – 132 credits, a component of choice – 4 credits, interim certification – 2 credits, final certification – 2 credits.

2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The duration of mastering the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" is 2 years. The academic year consists of 45 weeks, which is 2,100 hours and includes theoretical, clinical training and holidays, lasting 6 weeks between academic years. Final assessment lasting 2 weeks. The study week consists of 54 hours, 1/3 of which is the independent work of the resident during extracurricular time.

The distribution of disciplines by hours, academic periods is carried out by the CEP and the department of academic work in accordance with the SCES, TEP and the list of components of the choice, agreed with the vice-rector for academic activities. The individual work curriculum is formed for each resident for the entire period of study, agreed with the curator and approved by the dean of the internship and residency. The individual work plan reflects the schedule of training, the mode of classes (number of hours per day), the list of sections and disciplines, the number of hours by sections and disciplines, types of training classes, knowledge control forms. The syllabuses indicate the place and time of the training consultation for each resident.

2.5 Organization of training

University has adequate representation of staff, trainees and other stakeholders in the planning of the educational programme. For example, the Academic Committee with a subcommittee on residency includes heads of departments, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant specialty of the residency, leading specialists in practical health care, employers, and representatives of the student population. Thus, professor K.A. Zordinova is a member of all the committees listed in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)".

Residents studying under the programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" undergo training at clinical centers that provide training both inpatient and outpatient settings. In the presented clinical databases, planning and implementation of innovations in teaching methods and evaluation of students are provided. The department, headed by the head of the department, determines the clinical bases where the resident will be able to get access to patients in their profile of the residency educational programme at all levels of medical care. With clinical bases, the University concludes contracts, where residents are provided with access to patients and all resources. Experts visited the clinical base - SH No.1, where all the conditions for training residents in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" were demonstrated.

2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

The NEI KRMU adopted the Regulation on mentoring, approved by the Protocol of the Scientific and Clinical Council No.18 of June 17, 2019. Clinical mentors accompany the student on the clinical base of the department. This provision defines the priority goals of the mentor's work as assistance in acquiring, improving the professional theoretical and practical competencies of residents, mastering the norms of medical ethics and deontology, and educating them to be demanding and interested in the results of work in the process of joint clinical activities. The principle of rotation is also observed, in which the resident's clinical mentor changes depending on the department or clinical base on which the resident is located.

In addition to the mentor, in order to implement the training plan and the quality of the EP, residents are assigned a curator who participates in the preparation of the resident and is personally responsible for the implementation of the training plan, carries out measures for personal and psychological support of the resident during the stages of education.

All the above facts were confirmed by the experts of the EEC when studying the documentation and visiting the clinical base – SH No.1.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially – 1.

Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) The scientific component should be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods (2.2.4)
- 2) Develop quantitative indicators of R&D (2.2.4)

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

3.1 Methods of evaluation

When analyzing the documentation, the EEC experts established that the methods of evaluation of residents in the university for all specialties of the residency there is a unified policy of evaluation of residents, including in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)", the evaluation policy is reflected in the Regulation on Residence, Academic Policy of the University, the educational programme and syllabuses of disciplines. Also, the resident assessment policy is presented in electronic format on the Platonus and Keyps platforms and on the official website of the university.

The university has introduced an integrated assessment system that takes into account both formative assessment (FA) and summary assessment (SA), covering the theoretical knowledge and practical skills necessary for the future profession. Current monitoring is performed by an academic or clinical mentor. Line supervision evaluates the results of training upon completion of disciplines.

The EEC experts confirmed that the criteria for passing exams or other types of assessment, including the procedure for retaking in residency, are reflected in the "Residency Regulations", according to which, if the discipline is not mastered (score less than 50%), the resident re-masters the discipline in the summer semester on a fee basis. There were no such cases during the training on this EP.

A student of the residency who has completed the training programme and completed the individual curriculum is allowed to the Final Assessment. The final assessment is carried out in accordance with the final results of the training and includes two stages: 1) knowledge assessment (computer testing); 2) skills assessment. If the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills under the programme are positive, the resident is issued with a residency certificate. Also, this data is the basis for issuing a specialist certificate. This provision is described in the educational programme in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)". According to the Regulation on the Independent Examination, teachers from other universities who have an academic degree, as well as employers – the most experienced specialists from among practitioners of health care who have the highest qualification category and who were not clinical mentors in the process of training residents. Appeal of the results of the assessment of residents is carried out in accordance with the Academic Policy and the Residence Regulations. If the resident disagrees with the assessment of the final assessment, the resident has the right to appeal the assessment, the rules of appeal are described in the Regulation on the conduct of the appeal. In the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" final certification was not yet available, 2 residents are studying in the 1st year.

Also, the experts of the EEC confirm that in order to ensure the objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the Department of Internal Diseases has developed checklists for the current, midterm and final control of the discipline. Also, the department carries out the formation of a portfolio by each resident individually, in which all the achievements of the resident during the period of study in the residency are recorded. The portfolio serves as a basis for forming the characteristics of a resident and obtaining recommendations for further employment. Portfolio evaluation is carried out according to checklists developed by the department employees.

The compliance of control and measuring instruments with teaching methods and the specifics of the curriculum is monitored by a committee of educational programmes (CEP), which includes experienced methodologists and expert testologists. EEC experts were shown the procedure of passing the test in the test center of the university, and the staff of the registrar's office also showed that they keep observations and records during the examinations.

The results of students' academic achievements are recorded in the electronic educational journal through the office-recorder system and the AIS Platonus programme, which automatically generates examination sheets, which is confirmed by experts when viewing electronic journals.

3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

During the visit to the university, the EEC members confirmed that the methods of assessing residents are comparable with the methods of teaching and learning and cover the assessment of all the competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations.

Differentiated assessment methods are used to assess different learning outcomes, so theoretical knowledge is mainly assessed by testing, and practical skills are assessed using assessment sheets for each section of the practical work.

During the conversation with residents in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" it was established that the achievement of the results of training stated in the EP is carried out due to a significant number of thematic patients and a large volume of surgical interventions on specialized clinical bases, as well as constant advice from a clinical mentor or teacher. Residents are provided with the necessary access to both patient management and participation in manipulations, additional methods of examination (bronchoscopy, computed tomography, MRI, ultrasound, spirometry), all types of medical documentation, participation in consultations and clinical debriefings with colleagues of related specialties, work in a multidisciplinary team. Residents in the interview emphasized the importance of the chosen profession in connection with the pandemic, the opportunity

to work with patients in "Covid" hospitals, which helped them to significantly improve their clinical skills.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full.

Standard 3: Implemented

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

According to the data of the report and the results of the interview with teachers, administrative and managerial staff, before recruiting for the programme, the need for practical health care in specialists of one or another profile is studied, the resources of the university are thoroughly analyzed: the availability of clinical bases, a sufficient number of qualified personnel, the provision of educational and methodological literature, etc.

On the basis of the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No.600 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to study in educational institutions that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education", the University has developed internal Rules for admission to residency programmes.

Organizational issues of admission are handled by the admission commission of the university. It should be noted the positive practice on the part of the University - posting questions for an interview on the website of the university. In general, the information on admission provided on the website is quite detailed, indicating the dates and the list of necessary documents. Persons who have scored the highest points on the entrance examination are admitted to study on a competitive basis on a state educational order: for a residency – at least 75 points.

At the same time experts of EEC noted during the study of documentation of entrance examinations to residency that in the list questions on programmes of EP are narrowly specialized, without taking into account pre-requisites. Such a trend is noted for all EPs of the university residency, including this accredited programme.

4.2 Number of residents

In the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)", the university accepted 2 residents in 2021-2022, while the number of teachers and the capacity of clinical bases is quite sufficient to ensure the educational process. One of the residents is a foreign citizen from India.

In general, the number of residents is determined by the need of specialists in the industry and regions.

4.3 Resident support and advice

The functions of an academic adviser are performed by supervisors who are assigned to residents in addition to clinical mentors. Other types of counseling, if necessary, are carried out by professional services: a psychologist, a lawyer. A distinctive feature of the Kazakh-Russian University is high social responsibility. Thus, in accordance with the approved Regulation "On social support for students", approved in 2019, financial support is provided to orphaned students and students without parental care, whose parents have established disabilities of the first and second groups, from large and low-income families. All information about the university and about service services is presented on the website of KRMU. Residents are also informed about the services by corporate rezidentura@medkrmu.kz, by chat in the phone, by e-mail. Employees of the Career Center also advise on the employment of residents.

When conducting the survey, the vast majority, 83.3% of respondents, believe that programme managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning and 100% said that teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes. In interview residents noted that curators and mentors constantly keep in touch with them and about the problems and doubts, they always can turn to them for support.

4.4 Representation of residents

The meeting of the EEC members with the resident asset confirmed that the students actively participate in the life of the university, many of them are members of the University's Student Self-Government. Also, according to the submitted documentation, the composition of the CEP, the Academic Council, along with teachers and employers, includes residents. However, residents of this programme are not included in the advisory bodies of the university.

4.5 Working conditions

According to the results of the survey of residents when studying the issue of satisfaction with the conditions for training and the equipment of study rooms and classrooms, it turned out that 83.3% of residents in general at the university are satisfied with the provided conditions for training. The interview with residents also confirmed that residents are satisfied with the provided conditions for training and internship at clinical bases. It was confirmed during the interviews and the study of documentation that the contracts with clinical bases stipulate that residents are granted admission to patients and to all structural units, including clinical departments, intensive care unit in accordance with the needs of the educational process. Students in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" have the opportunity to participate in morning medical conferences, rounds, consultations both as listeners and as speakers. Participate in various activities at clinical sites. A training room has been allocated in State Security Committee No. 1. In the residency rooms, access to computer equipment is provided. Residents use the login of clinical mentors when filling in the documentation. Shifts are carried out in a planned manner according to the schedule, during which the residents replied that they are also provided with optimal conditions. Although the foreign resident answered that prefers to go on duty in daytime on days off.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially – 1.

Standard 4: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Include only the subjects of prerequisites in the programme of entrance examinations and exclude highly specialized topics (4.1.6)

Standard 5: FACULTY

Evidence of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy

The University has developed and successfully operates a Personnel Policy, which reflects: the selection and admission of employees, the development and activities of employees, the promotion of employees, etc. In order to verify the standard 5, in addition to personnel policy, interviews were conducted with employees of the personnel department, teachers, the results of the survey of teaching staff conducted by the ECAQA observer were studied. Thus, competitive selection is carried out on the basis of the current Regulation on the competitive substitution of positions of faculty and researchers, approved by the order of the rector No. 26-02-44-n/k dated November 27, 2020. The conversation with K.A. Zordinova, Acting Head of the Department of Internal Diseases, allowed the experts to learn about the approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (2 people in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, information security of EP, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources. In general, according to the results of the survey, 92, 86% of the surveyed faculty answered that they were satisfied with the work of the personnel service, everyone was satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace. I would like to note that according to the programme being implemented by head of the department in the interview also noted the satisfaction with the work of the personnel service, as a strength should be noted the high percentage of calorific value of the department – 90%.

5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

Experts conducted interviews with faculty members, the head of the personnel service and other structural units, as well as questionnaires of teachers by an ECAQA observer in order to verify the standard 5.

There is a system of professional and pedagogical improvement of the teaching staff of the NEI

"KRMU", which includes the following units: the School of the teacher, the Institute of postgraduate education, winter and summer schools, which contribute to the formation and development of the competence and potential of the teaching staff.

According to the results of the survey of teachers, 100% noted that the university has an opportunity for career growth and development of competencies. Most of them have undergone advanced training in the past 5 years and fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals. However, unfortunately, 42.86% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events. 42.86% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 7.14% used them, 28.57% do not know and 21.43% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The majority of 92.86 per cent of teachers responded that the management and administration listened to the teachers' opinions. At the Department of Internal Diseases, where the EP is implemented, during the interviews, the answers to the questions were positive, the teaching staff regularly undergo advanced training in winter and summer schools and mentors are attracted.

At the same time, the experts found no evidence on which criteria the assessment of teaching staff and clinical mentors is carried out. No response was received on the issues of differentiated payment, the development of indicators and the criteria for rating points. Although in order to stimulate and improve the quality of the educational process, as well as to achieve the strategic goals of the university, it is recommended to develop indicators of the work of teaching staff in all activities, as well as to evaluate the work of clinical mentors.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 7 standards: fully – 6, partially – 1.

Standard 5: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Develop evaluation criteria for teaching staff and clinical mentors (5.2.4)

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Evidence of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

In general, according to the survey conducted by the observer of the accreditation center, the university received positive answers to the questions of logistics and equipment. Thus, 83.3% of residents answered that they were fully satisfied with the provided conditions for training and equipping the study rooms and classrooms of KRMU, and in the conversation, the residents of the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" confirmed that they were fully satisfied with the training conditions. The experts visited the clinical base to ensure that there are good learning conditions for residents, study rooms equipped with computers and an interactive board, a large hall with multimedia equipment for holding joint meetings of the Magazine Club, which was demonstrated at the meeting. Residents have access to all types of equipment and manipulations at the clinical base. In general, when surveying the university, all 100% of residents also confirmed that office equipment is available on the basis of practice, and teachers fully, in 100% of cases, provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. In oral conversation with residents of this programme, this fact is also confirmed.

6.2 Clinical Bases

The Department of Internal Diseases, which implements the programme in the specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" located on the basis of the City Clinical Hospital No.1, where the same department implements the EP residency in the specialties of allergology and rheumatology. The Department is headed by Dr. med. Prof. K.A. Zordinova, who is also a part-time researcher at this clinical base, which allows residents wider access to hospital resources. There are clinical mentors on the same base. In addition, the clinical base is also the Central Clinical Hospital, but it could not be visited due to time pressures. During the visit to the clinical base – the city clinical hospital No.1, experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with the disciplines of the programme, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health

care. In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in their specialty – 2 (residents of the 1st year of study), one of whom is a resident from India. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations.

At the same time, the experts did not find any confirmation during the interview with residents about the implementation of the pediatric component at the relevant clinical bases, although everything is described in the syllabuses and the programme. The residents themselves explain this fact that in the fall semester they were forced to work mainly with "Covid" patients during the pandemic. Therefore, at present, to remedy the situation, residents are on duty on Saturdays and visit children's outpatient appointments and children's departments of hospitals once a week, which is of course insufficient to obtain competencies in the reception of children, counselling and treatment skills. Thus, the skew towards the adult component is obtained, although in terms of the distribution of hours, children's and adults' pulmonology contain the same number of loans (66 loans each according to the WC and the syllabus).

6.3 Information technology

Residents who participated in the questionnaire conducted by the ECAQA observer answered that they have full access to electronic educational resources. In addition, all 100 per cent responded that they were fully satisfied with the library collection and resources. This fact was confirmed by the residents of this programme in an interview.

Experts visited the library, the department of remote technologies. When visiting the library, the experts made sure that residents were provided with all the main sources of literature on the catalogue, which are updated on an ongoing basis, and there is wide access to information databases.

When visiting the remote technology department and during the interviews, the employees demonstrated all the possibilities and advantages of using remote learning technologies, the possibility of obtaining information.

I would like to emphasize once again that the library and the department of remote technologies are among the strengths of the university. These resources allow students and teachers to gain additional advantages in learning and obtaining information.

However, when studying the university's website, experts found no confirmation of the availability of information for students resident (class schedule, educational programme, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks). In interview residents also confirmed this fact. Such information speaks to the transparency of the educational process and helps students to familiarize themselves with the materials and curriculum in advance.

6.4 Clinical Teams

In order to validate the self-assessment report, experts visited the clinical bases and conducted interviews with residents, faculty members, employees of clinical bases, clinical mentors. The facts of daily participation of residents in the work of the department, patient supervision, participation in daily meetings, conferences, the work of auxiliary departments, as well as interaction with coordinating doctors, junior staff have been confirmed. All work in resident departments is supervised by clinical mentors. Thus, taking into account that the overwhelming number of hours is released for practice, residents learn interaction and work in a team on clinical bases.

6.5 Medical Research and Advances

Priority areas of research of employees are theoretical and practical issues of diagnosis and treatment of lung diseases, i.e. the head of the department and employees have publications and speeches at conferences on pulmonology, mainly on the experience of managing patients with COVID, taking into account trends in this direction and accumulated experience. Residents are also involved in this work. 1 resident has a publication on the management of patients with Covid together with the staff of the department. However, this fact is isolated. Experts did not find confirmation of the participation of residents in research, speeches at the conference. Also, when studying individual plans, experts noted

that they did not reflect research activities, there is no plan for conducting research, speaking at conferences and preparing for publications.

6.6 Education expertise

When analyzing the Regulations on the Commission for Quality Assurance of Educational Programmes, (Order 26-02-70 nk dated 06.09.21), the quality of the implemented EP residency is assessed sequentially: the department (planning, development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, revision of EP), CEP (planning, development, monitoring, evaluation, revision of EP), OAW (coordination, control of compliance with the NLS, monitoring, evaluation of EP), OR (implementation, monitoring, revision of EP), DP&CEP (coordination, monitoring, evaluation, revision of EP), AC (approval, evaluation, revision of EP), Scientific Council (approval, evaluation, revision of EP).

As for research in the field of medical education, publication of articles in this direction, the experts were convinced during the interview that the teaching staff have no incentives and motivation to work in this direction. According to experts, the strengthening of work in this area will lead to an improvement in the quality of the educational process. This trend is noted throughout the university.

6.7 Training in other institutions

Teachers of the department have the opportunity to exchange experience with domestic colleagues from other universities of Kazakhstan and given the unique location of the university in Almaty, where there are 3 universities conducting medical education, in KRMU there is an opportunity to exchange experience with colleagues. The state of academic mobility of students is still unsatisfactory due to the start of admission in 2021 and due to the current epidemiological situation, this programme was not implemented.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards: fully - 17, partially – 4

Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Ensure implementation of the pediatric component at appropriate clinical sites (6.2.1)
- 2) Update information on the website for resident students (class schedule, EP, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks) (6.3.3)
- 3) Individual plans are recommended to reflect research activities (R&D topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.) (6.5.4)
- 4) Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

The system of EP monitoring and evaluation is the same for all departments implementing residency programmes, including the programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)". Monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at the level of departments, residency department, CEP, Academic Council, Alumni Career Center, which maintains communication with employers. All data on the monitoring system were obtained by experts during interviews with representatives of these structures, as well as when visiting them at the workplace and based on the documentation provided. The main types of monitoring include: the availability of educational process resources (clinical bases, educational literature, classroom fund, equipment, the composition of teaching staff: teachers, clinical mentors, supervisors); compliance of curricula with the requirements of the State Educational Standard; feedback from stakeholders on the quality of the content of the EP; student performance. Then the results of monitoring are heard at meetings of collegial bodies: the CEP, the Academic Council, the Scientific Council. Decisions of collegial bodies are published on the university's website. The results of the discussion of the EP for the CEP are communicated to the faculty of the University.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

When surveyed during the EEC, residents answered that they have 100% feedback from teachers, which is confirmed when interviewing students. The report indicates and confirms during the interview with employers that practitioners of health care are involved in discussing the expected learning

outcomes; in assessing the learning achievements of students, educational trajectories. A survey is conducted among faculty and residents on satisfaction with working and training conditions. For feedback with teachers and residents, the Rector's blog, a reception on personal issues, as well as regular meetings with the management of the university are used.

7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

The Career Center regularly conducts a feedback study on the topic: "Satisfaction of employers with graduates of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity". Based on the feedback results, an analysis of the nonconformities is carried out, their causes are determined, the need for corrective measures is assessed,

7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

From the report, it follows and the data confirm the interview with the administration, teaching staff, employers. In 2021, the Career Center conducted a sociological survey "Employers' satisfaction with graduates of KRMU, a total of 30 employers participated (60% response rate) from 6 regions and the city of Almaty. The results of the survey on the quality of graduate training showed that all employers positively assessed their knowledge and skills. Annually, round tables are held with employers (programme and minutes of April 23, 2021). Based on the results of feedback, an analysis of nonconformities, the need for corrective measures is carried out, and then registration and analysis of the effectiveness and efficiency of the actions taken are carried out. The results of feedback and corrective actions are heard at meetings of the department, the CEP, the Academic Council. An online interview with employers confirmed that the organizations are generally satisfied with the work of university graduates and have a relationship and cooperation with the faculty of the department. Also repeatedly in interview it was emphasized and documented that representatives of practical health care, residents are included in advisory bodies of higher education institution. The data are given for the entire university as a whole. As for the 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" graduation was not yet, 2 residents are trained, who are not included in the advisory bodies, but confirmed that the decisions are communicated to them on an ongoing basis. Acting Head of the Department K.A. Zordinova is a part-time employee on the basis of SH No.1, so she involves the administration and other representatives of practical health care in the discussion of the EP, the educational process in addition to clinical mentors.

7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

During the interview with all stakeholders, from the report data, as well as when providing documentation, it is confirmed that the EP passes all stages of approval. After the development, receiving reviews on the EP and discussion at the enlarged meeting of the department with the involvement of representatives of practical health care and residents, the EP undergoes approval for the CEP.

The CEP carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, achieving tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the training methodology), as well as an assessment of the educational and methodological support and support of the educational process. Thus, the educational programme is approved at the meeting of the department, the CEP and the Academic Council.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 7: Implemented

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of compliance:

8.1 Management

The NEI "KRMU" implements the EP on residency in the specialty "Pulmonology adult, children" in accordance with the regulations approved by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the internal rules for the organization of the educational process in the residency. Requirements for admission, planning the number of students, the ratio of teaching staff to the number of residents, the evaluation scale, etc. are observed.

The management of the university is open to changes, ready to discuss initiatives in the field of

academic management, which was confirmed by a meeting with the administration. Transparency in the management of the educational programme is carried out by discussing the educational and methodological documentation for the programme of the residency of specialty 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" at the meeting of the CEP, AC, and after receiving their positive conclusion is approved by the vice-rector for scientific and clinical work. The website of the university provides information on the educational programmes of the residency: information for admissions, schedule of classes, academic calendar, etc. <https://krmu.edu.kz/akademicheskij-kalendar-2/>

8.2 Academic Leadership

The management of the EP of the residence is carried out in accordance with the organizational structure of the NEI KRMU. There are Regulations on structural divisions and job descriptions, which specify responsibilities, functional responsibilities. The leaders of the management of the educational process are not only the administration, but also members of the advisory bodies - the CEP, the Academic Council, with whom the experts met during the interviews and received answers to their questions. The Academic Council organizes and considers the introduction of various forms of methodological work aimed at improving the educational process. The academic policy, <https://krmu.edu.kz/akademicheskaya-chestnost/>, which regulates the rights, obligations and responsibilities of students and the administration of the university, the procedure for organizing the educational process, is annually reviewed and approved in the NEI "KRMU". These rules stipulate the officials responsible for the proper implementation of the Rules and the scope of their responsibility.

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of NEI KRMU is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services. Manages the distribution of the budget directly by the first head, the direct executors of financial issues are the director of the department of financial work and the chief accountant. As evidenced by the oral responses of the participants of the focus group of teachers for the material support of the educational process, the departments submit applications, the distribution of resources depends on the previous level of provision. The management has identified human resources as its main resource, while the administration of the university, as both managers and teaching staff indicate, allocates enough funding for the development of human resources.

8.4 Administration and Management

The administrative and teaching staff is formed from the standards of the ratio of the contingent to these categories. There is a quality management system department in the NEI, a quality assurance policy, the Strategic Development Plan of the NEI KazRosmeduniversity and the University Mission have been developed and communicated to the interested parties.

Residency programmes are administered by a team headed by leaders: vice-rector for academic work and vice-rector for scientific and clinical work. Ensuring the quality of the educational process in the residency is determined by the fulfillment of the mandatory requirements of the SCES 2017.2020; the creation of a system for monitoring the effectiveness of the teaching staff and the implementation of the IEP of the resident.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

NEI KRMU strictly complies with the requirements of legislative and programme documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including on the organization of the educational process in the residency . The Regulation on Residency was developed in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Concept for the Development of Medical Education and determines the procedure for training medical personnel in the Residency in the organizations of medical education and science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, regardless of the forms of ownership, having a license for this type of educational activity and clinical bases. In order to effectively plan, develop and implement the residency programmes of the NEI KRMU included representatives of practical health care, residents and teachers

of departments in the advisory bodies (CEP, AC), who have the right to make changes, make proposals and comments.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 8: Implemented

There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit

6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)":

1. The scientific component should be included in the thematic plan in the form of tasks based on the application of scientific analysis methods (2.2.4)
2. Develop quantitative indicators of R&D (2.2.4)
3. Include only the subjects of prerequisites in the programme of entrance examinations and exclude highly specialized topics (4.1.6)
4. Develop evaluation criteria for teaching staff and clinical mentors (5.2.4)
5. Ensure implementation of the pediatric component at appropriate clinical sites (6.2.1)
6. Update information on the website for resident students (class schedule, EP, self-control questions, syllabuses, training tasks) (6.3.3)
7. Individual plans are recommended to reflect research activities (R&D topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.) (6.5.4)
8. Develop a system to motivate health education research staff (6.6.3)

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme 7R01107 – "Pulmonology (adult, children's)" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17	-	-
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	29	1	-
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11	-	-
4	STUDENTS	30	29	1	-
5	FACULTY	7	6	1	-
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	17	4	-
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15	-	-
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15	-	-
	Total:	146	139	7	
			146		